MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA

Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard **November 18, 2010**

Present: Robert Ferguson, Jennifer Haskamp, Pat Igo, Rich Laffin, John Manning, Matt

Mazanec, Lee Meyer, Mark Thomas, Steve Trimble, Diane Trout-Oertel

Absent: David Riehle (excused),

Staff Present: Amy Spong, Christine Boulware,

BUSINESS MEETING

CALL TO ORDER: 5:05 PM by John Manning (Chair)

I. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA: The agenda was approved as presented.

II. CONFLICTS OF INTERESTP: None stated.

III. CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. The chair announced the nomination committee will be created at the next business meeting.

IV. STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS

- **A.** The next Executive Committee Meeting is canceled.
- **B.** Staff will send out the draft mitigation plan for the OMF and work with Chair Manning to draft a letter by the November 29 deadline.
- **C.** CURA is hosting a Housing Forum on Conservation Districts on November 19.
- **D.** The Union Depot and C&E Building will be coming in for Pre-Application reviews at the December business meeting.
- **E.** The City Council overturned the HPC decision regarding window replacement at 300 Maple Street.

V. PUBLIC HEARING/PERMIT REVIEW

A. 95 Mackubin Street, Hill Historic District, by Harvey Sherman, owner, for a building permit to remodel the front porch. File #11-005 (Boulware, 266-6715)

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Harvey Sherman, owner, was present to discuss the application. He stated his agreement with the staff recommendation and his appreciation of the site visit and input from committee members. He added he incorporated some input into his design. Laffin asked if the brackets will cut into the rake boards. Sherman replied, yes. Laffin asked if the same patter will be replicated. Sherman replied each house has its own distinct pattern and what remains will stay, but new rake board will match 99 Mackubin. Laffin asked about the space between the windows. Sherman replied six inches typical. Ferguson asked if any historic material was incased in the porch. Sherman replied he hadn't discovered any yet. Trimble asked about prior residents of the building. Staff gave a brief history of the property owner and development of the lots.

Igo motioned to approve the application with staff recommendations. Ferguson seconded the motion. The motion passed 10-0.

B. 308 Prince Street, Lowertown Historic District, by Andrew Commers, Artspace Projects, Inc., for building permits for exterior improvements including: reroofing, repointing the masonry and window repair and replacement. **File #11-006** (Spong, 266-6714).

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Ferguson asked about

findings #4 & #5. Would staff review the color and cladding? Andrew Commers, ArtSpace, and Scott England, DJR, were present to discuss the application. Commers stated there is a co-op in the building and they've had good financing success. They hope to start construction next spring. England stated they are addressing deferred maintenance. The loading dock area foundation is crumbling and the roof is in need of replacement. They plan to repair original wood windows. Manning asked if they were comfortable with staff recommendations. England replied they were and will work with staff. Trout-Oertel stated appreciation of applicants willing to restore original windows. Igo added this is a big job and a big deal. Laffin stated he is glad the project doesn't propose screens. Commers and England replied the building historically didn't have screens. Laffin asked about the 25% re-pointing and how they plan to match the mortar without it looking patch. England replied they have mortar specs for a color match and don't intend to clean the whole building. Trout-Oertel stated it won't be too evident over time.

Igo motioned to approve the application with staff recommendations. Trout-Oertel seconded the motion. The motion passed 10-0.

C. 260 Fifth Street East, Lowertown Historic District, by Diane Nordquist, City of Saint Paul, for permits to construct a new, five-story, brick clad, mixed-use rental building with fifty-eight units. **File #11-007** (Spong, 266-6714).

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Manning inquired about how exposed the building is from the South. Trout-Oertel asked if stucco had been approved in the district before. Staff replied on penthouses and maybe the rear of lot 270. Trout-Oertel asked if it were dominant in the district and if the spandrel color had been changed to match based on discussion at the pre-application review. Staff replied the applicant had brought a material board. Manning asked about signage. Staff informed that a sign permit application will need to be submitted and may be reviewed by staff. A retail tenant had not yet been chosen and the art component was not yet resolved.

Brian Gorecki, Alatus, and David Haaland, UrbanWorks, were present to discuss the application. Gorecki showed images and explained the base block was 12" by 24". He showed updated color rendering and explained that the light fixtures had dropped and the canopies were raised. He added the water table was more evident, banding was in the notes and the cap wasn't visible at the second floor. He continued to discuss the installation of a rough-cut stone at the pedestrian level and added that detail could be worked out with the design review committee. The private alley will become green space and the green roof will require a second egress. There are two entrances for two levels of garage and no intentions to apply stucco at the rear elevations, but instead plan to install painted Hardi Board. They intend to break up the massing of the wall with a different material. Haaland discussed the materials on the board and stated the will show a mock-up. The accent panel will match the rust color in the brick and rock-faced CMU will be installed on the secondary elevations. The cast-stone accent in the masonry will match the base. Gorecki stated they intend to use Pella windows with a wide sash rail without screens. They will build vertical trim between the windows to create depth. He stated they are comfortable with the staff recommendations.

Trout-Oertel asked about changing the color panels and base materials from primary to secondary elevations and the dramatic visual effect it has. Gorecki replied that going from brick to Hardi Panel on the secondary elevation meets the guidelines and that he is open to color on the rear, but prefers a lighter color with the "green roof." Laffin asked about offsetting the brick from the Hardi. Haaland replied there will be a 4 inch reveal. Laffin asked about the abrupt change from brick to precast and there being no play between materials. Staff stated the proportion of the building

compared to the Northwestern is "squatty." Gorecki replied the base is larger because of the grade change. Laffin asked about a brick accent to top the window openings. Manning suggested that color on the secondary elevations be added to the design review committee list. Ferguson stated it is a thoughtful design with the corner entry bring in the public realm but thought the difficult slope and ramp issue were a challenge.

Mazanec motioned to approve the application with staff recommendations. Laffin seconded the motion. Trout-Oertel offered a friendly amendment that the design review committee review material color choices for the non-primary elevations. The amendment was accepted. The motion passed 9-0.

VI. OLD BUSINESS

A. Victoria Theater Designation, **825 University Avenue**, Recommendation to consider the property a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Site and make a recommendation to the City Council. The public hearing was held on November 4th and was continued to November 18th. (Spong, 266-6714).

Staff received two more letters in support of designation.

Pat Lindgren, 582 Charles, testified that she feels strongly about preserving Frogtown History.

Ann Thom, 1355 N. Victoria St., testified that her 97 year old great aunt remember the café. The building is a connection to family, history and the city. It connects generations.

Dan Moffatt, 6433 Parnell Ave., Edina, testified that he has been speaking with Bee Vue, owner, and is interested in purchasing and developing the property. He stated it is a tremendous theater and he found out about the opportunity through Kurt Gegenhuber. He added that he wants to see the building preserved and give it new life for the next 100 years. He had questions about the process. Staff gave a brief explanation. Moffatt explained he would be interested in a mural on the exterior that recalls the history. Staff explained that the draft preservation program will go to City Council and it is based on Federal Standards. The next public hearing will be at City Council.

The public hearing was closed. Thomas motioned to recommend designation to City Council. Igo seconded the motion. The motion passed 9-0.

VII. COMMITTEE REPORTS

- **A.** Education Committee (Ferguson, Thomas, Trout-Oertel): The committee plan to meet the Monday after Thanksgiving.
- **B.** Lowertown Master Plan Steering Committee (Ferguson): The steering committee will meet again on November 9. There will be a community meeting with the consultants on November 30. There are nine focus groups.
- **C.** Saint Paul Historic Survey Partnership Project (Trimble): Staff reported the kick-off meeting was last Monday.
- **D.** Public Safety Building Mitigation (Penfield) (Manning, Igo): Staff informed that the 106 Group was hired to do the documentation of the building.
- **E.** 3M Advisory Committee/Workgroups update (Trimble, Mazanec): It was reported that 4.3 acres of the site have been purchase. This won't affect the mitigation. Mazanec informed staff that he is no longer receiving the emails.

VIII. ADJOURN: 7:07 pm

Submitted by: C. Boulware